THESIS

AN ANALYSIS OF THE RELEVANCE OF ILLUSTRATIONS TO TEXT IN FIVE BASAL READING SERIES FOR GRADE THREE

Submitted By
Marguerite Louise White

White, Marguerite L. An analysis of the relevance of illustrations to text in five basal reading Series for Grade III
Thesis
1951

BOSTON UNIVERSITY
SCHOOL OF EDUCATION

Ed.

LIBRARY

Thesis
White, M.L.
1951

The Gift of Marguerite L. White

stored

Ed.
Thesis
White, Marguerite L.
1951
stored

BOSTON UNIVERSITY

SCHOOL OF EDUCATION

THESIS

AN ANALYSIS OF THE RELEVANCE OF ILLUSTRATIONS TO TEXT IN FIVE BASAL READING SERIES FOR GRADE THREE

Submitted by

Marguerite Louise White

(B.A., Trinity College, Washington, D.C.)

(1951)

In partial fulfillment of the requirements for

the degree of Master of Education

August, 1951

Boston University
School of Education
Library

First Reader: Brian A. Murphy, Professor of Education

Second Reader: Donald O. Durrell, Professor of Education

Table of Contents

Introduction.....Page 1

Chapter I - Plan of the Study.....Page 3

Chapter II - Analysis of Data.....Page 13

Chapter III - Summary and Conclusions.....Page 35

Bibliography.....Page 43

Table of Contents

List of Tables

1 - Third Readers Used in the Study.....Page 14

Ginn Basic Readers

II - Finding New Neighbors: Third Reader, Level 1.Pages 15-16

III - Friends Far and Near: Third Reader, Level 2..Pages 17-18

IV - Total Inaccuracies Occurring in the Ginn Basic Readers.....Page 19

Laidlaw Basic Readers

V - Children Everywhere.....Pages 20-21

VI - Total Inaccuracies Occurring in the Laidlaw Basic Readers.....Page 22

Today's Work-Play Books

VII - On Longer Trails.....Pages 23-24

VIII - Total Inaccuracies Occurring in Today's Work-Play Books.....Page 25

Reading Foundation Series

IX - If I Were Going.....Pages 26-27

X - Total Inaccuracies Occurring in the Reading Foundation Series.....Page 28

Curriculum Foundation Series

XI - Streets and Roads: Third Reader, Level 1.....Pages 29-30

XII - More Streets and Roads: Third Reader, Level 2.....Pages 31-32

XIII - Total Inaccuracies Occurring in the Curriculum Foundation Series.....Page 33

XIV - Summary of Illustrations and Inaccuracies in the Five Basal Series Examined in the Study..Page 34

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2016 with funding from
Boston Library Consortium Member Libraries

https://archive.org/details/analysisofreleva00whit

Introduction

The basal readers form an integral part of the reading program. Gradation of vocabulary is perhaps the most important aspect of the reading program, yet illustrations also portray their own important role in building a constructive reading series.

A good illustration should act as a means of building reading vocabulary and also as a clue in discovering word meaning.

Williams[1] cites the following criteria for judging illustrations - particularly those in textbooks:

1. Illustration should have one central theme and should avoid details that detract from it.
2. Illustrations should be rich in thought content.
3. Illustration should supplement the textual material and aid in its interpretation and clarification.
4. Illustration should be clear, distinct and artistic.
5. Illustration should furnish a vicarious experience which corresponds closely with a real situation.

Stutz[2] says that illustrations are not merely for color or to arouse interest, but gives the following opinion:

"In a well illustrated textbook the pictorial

---

1. Williams, Paul T. "Textbooks Need Better Pictures". The Nation's Schools 33:50-52; June, 1944.

2. Stutz, Fred. Eighteenth Yearbook, National Council for the Social Studies 10;88-93; 1947.

Introduction

The basal readers form an integral part of the reading program. Gradation of vocabulary is perhaps the most important aspect of the reading program, yet illustrations also portray their own important role in building a constructive reading series.

A good illustration should act as a means of building reading vocabulary and also as a clue in discovering word meaning.

Williams[1] cites the following criteria for judging illustrations - particularly those in textbooks:

1. Illustration should have one central theme and should avoid details that detract from it.

2. Illustrations should be rich in thought content.

3. Illustration should supplement the textual material and aid in its interpretation and clarification.

4. Illustration should be clear, distinct and artistic.

5. Illustration should furnish a vicarious experience which corresponds closely with a real situation.

Stute[2] says that illustrations are not merely for color or to arouse interest, but gives the following opinion:

"In a well illustrated textbook the pictorial

---

1. Williams, Paul T. "Textbooks Need Better Pictures". The Nation's Schools 33:50-52; June, 1944.

2. Stute, Fred. Eighteenth Yearbook, National Council for the Social Studies 10:88-89; 1947.

> material should be selected by the authors as the basis of their relation to the problems treated in the book. Illustrations should be skillfully reproduced, located as closely as possible to the written passages with which they are associated, and accompanied by meaningful captions."

Because illustrations are primarily an aid to understanding word meaning and vocabulary, it is necessary that such illustrations be well constructed and presented as an integral part of the text. Illustrations incorporated merely for design or color are useless and a hindrance rather than a help to the young reader.

Concerning the value of illustrations, Evans[1] offers the following:

> "Illustrations must be an interpretation of a text and not a distraction and they should be so arranged as to grow out of the type pages and not seem just some sort of fancy applique tacked on for packaging effects."

This study is an attempt to determine the frequency and type of inaccuracies occurring in illustrations in third grade readers in five basal reading series.

This is one part of a group project.

---

1. Evans, Margaret B. "Design in Children's Books". The Horn Book Magazine, Vol. XXVII, No. 3, 169-75; May-June, 1951.

material should be selected by the authors as the basis of their relation to the problems treated in the book. Illustrations should be skillfully reproduced, located as closely as possible to the written passages with which they are associated, and accompanied by meaningful captions."

Because illustrations are primarily an aid to understanding word meaning and vocabulary, it is necessary that such illustrations be well constructed and presented as an integral part of the text. Illustrations incorporated merely for design or color are useless and a hindrance rather than a help to the young reader.

Concerning the value of illustrations, Evans[1] offers the following:

> "Illustrations must be an interpretation of a text and not a distraction and they should be so arranged as to grow out of the type pages and not seem just some sort of fancy applique tacked on for pocketing effects."

This study is an attempt to determine the frequency and type of inaccuracies occurring in illustrations in third grade readers in five basal reading series.

This is one part of a group project.

---

1. Evans, Margaret B. "Design in Children's Books". The Horn Book Magazine, Vol. XXVII, No. 3, 188-78; May-June, 1951.

CHAPTER I

PLAN OF THE STUDY

The purpose of this study was to analyze illustrations in basal reading series for grade three.

Five basal reading series for grade three were analyzed. The chosen series are widely employed in the elementary reading program.

The following series were studied:

I. Russell, David H., Wulfing, Gretchen, Ousley, Odille, The Ginn Basic Readers, Ginn and Company, New York, 1948.

   A. Third Reader, Level 1: Finding New Neighbors

   B. Third Reader, Level 2: Friends Far and Near

II. Yoakam, Gerald, Hester, Kathleen, Abney, Louise, Laidlaw Basic Readers, Laidlaw Bros., Inc., New York, 1947.

   A. Third Reader: Children Everywhere

III. Gates, Arthur I., Huber, Miriam Blanton, Peardon, Celeste C., Salisbury, Frank Seely, Today's Work-Play Books, The Macmillan Company, Boston, 1945.

   A. Third Reader: On Larger Trails

IV. O'Donnell, Mabel, Reading Foundation Series: The New Alice and Jerry Books, Row, Peterson and Company, Evanston, Illinois, 1947.

   A. Third Reader: If I Were Going

V. Gray, William S. and Arbuthnot, Mary Hill, Basic Readers: Curriculum Foundation Series, Scott, Foresman and Company, New York, 1946-47 edition.

   A. Third Reader, Level 1: Streets and Roads

   B. Third Reader, Level 2: More Streets and Roads

In order to analyze illustrations in the five basal

CHAPTER I

PLAN OF THE STUDY

The purpose of this study was to analyze illustrations in basal reading series for grade three.

Five basal reading series for grade three were analyzed. The chosen series are widely employed in the elementary reading program.

The following series were studied:

I. Russell, David H., Walpire, Gretchen, Cuseley, Odille, *The Ginn Basic Readers*, Ginn and Company, New York, 1948.

A. Third Reader, Level 1: *Finding New Neighbors*

B. Third Reader, Level 2: *Friends Far and Near*

II. Yoakam, Gerald, Reeder, Kathleen, Abney, Louise, *Laidlaw Basic Readers*, Laidlaw Bros., Inc., New York, 1947.

A. Third Reader: *Children Everywhere*

III. Gates, Arthur I., Huber, Miriam Blanton, Pearson, Gertrude C., Hillebury, Frank Brady, *Today's Work-Play Books*, The Macmillan Company, Boston, 1948.

A. Third Reader: *On Larger Trails*

IV. O'Donnell, Mabel, *Reading Foundation Series: The New Alice and Jerry Books*, Row, Peterson and Company, Evanston, Illinois, 1947.

A. Third Reader: *If I Were Going*

V. Gray, William S. and Arbuthnot, Mary Hill, *Basic Readers: Curriculum Foundation Series*, Scott, Foresman and Company, New York, 1947-48 edition.

A. Third Reader, Level 1: *Streets and Roads*

B. Third Reader, Level 2: *More Streets and Roads*

In order to analyze illustrations in the five basal

reading series, a check list for inaccuracies consisting of sixteen (16) items was used. This check list was derived from one containing eighteen (18) items used in Peck's[1] thesis. Each of the 1405 illustrations analyzed was examined for the inaccuracies in the check list.

The following is the check list used in the study:

CHECK LIST FOR ILLUSTRATIONS

1. Inaccurate illustration of action words.
2. Inaccurate illustration of size concepts.
3. Inaccurate illustration of position.
4. Inaccurate illustration of color.
5. Inaccurate word and story concepts.
6. Inaccurate illustration of statement of fact.
7. Inaccurate illustration of real life situations.
8. Inaccurate illustration of people, places or things.
9. Illustrations which are unrelated to the text.
10. Illustrations which emphasize minor ideas, or only a portion of the text content.
11. Illustrations placed before the text.
12. Illustrations placed after the text.

---

1. Peck, Eleanor F. An Analysis of the Relevance of Illustrations to Text In Five Basal Reading Series for Grade One. Master's thesis, Boston University; School of Education, 1950, 88 pp.

reading series, a check list for inaccuracies consisting of sixteen (16) items was used. This check list was derived from one containing eighteen (18) items used in Peck's[1] thesis. Each of the 1405 illustrations analyzed was examined for the inaccuracies in the check list.

The following is the check list used in the study:

CHECK LIST FOR ILLUSTRATIONS

1. Inaccurate illustration of action words.
2. Inaccurate illustration of size concepts.
3. Inaccurate illustration of position.
4. Inaccurate illustration of color.
5. Inaccurate word and story concepts.
6. Inaccurate illustration of statement of fact.
7. Inaccurate illustration of real life situations.
8. Inaccurate illustration of people, places or things.
9. Illustrations which are unrelated to the text.
10. Illustrations which emphasize minor ideas, or only a portion of the text content.
11. Illustrations placed before the text.
12. Illustrations placed after the text.

---

1. Peck, Eleanor T. An Analysis of the Relevance of Illustrations to Text in Five Basal Reading Series for Grade One. Master's thesis, Boston University; School of Education, 1960. 58 pp.

13. Illustrations which lack clarity in general outline.

14. Illustrations which give inadequate help on word recognition.

15. Illustrations which show change within a unit.

16. Illustrations which show results which should be expected from text content.

The individual items of the check list used in the study are defined as follows, and examples of each are given:

1. Inaccurate illustration of action words: Illustrations which show actions different from the actions described in the accompanying text.

Page 42, "Children Everywhere"[1] presents the text: So he (Little Pear) stood by the side of the road and looked at everything."

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 14, shows Little Pear kneeling.

2. Inaccurate illustration of size concepts: Illustrations in which the size of the person, place or thing described in the text is not made clear or obvious.

Page 84 in "Friends Far and Near"[2] presents the text: "One man was sitting on a box, cutting up piles of shiny little fish with a big sharp knife."

---

1. Yoakam, Gerald, Hester, Kathleen, Abney, Louise, Laidlaw Basic Readers, Laidlaw Bros., Inc., New York, 1947.

2. Russell, David H., Wulfing, Gretchen, Ousley, Odille, The Ginn Basic Readers, Ginn and Company, New York, 1948.

13. Illustrations which lack clarity in general outline.

14. Illustrations which give inadequate help on word recognition.

15. Illustrations which show change within a unit.

16. Illustrations which show results which should be expected from text content.

The individual items of the check list used in the study are defined as follows, and examples of each are given:

1. Inaccurate illustration of action words: Illustrations which show actions different from the actions described in the accompanying text.

Page 42, "Children Everywhere"[1] presents the text: So he (Little Pear) stood by the side of the road and looked at everything."

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 14, shows Little Pear kneeling.

2. Inaccurate illustration of size concepts: Illustrations in which the size of the person, place or thing described in the text is not made clear or obvious.

Page 24 in "Friends Far and Near"[2] presents the text: "One man was sitting on a box, cutting up piles of shiny little fish with a big sharp knife."

---

1. Yoakam, Gerald, Heater, Kathleen, Abney, Louise, Holiday Basic Readers, Laidlaw Bros., Inc., New York, 1947.

2. Russell, David H., Nulling, Gretchen, Guiney, Odille, The Ginn Basic Readers, Ginn and Company, New York, 1948.

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 48, shows a man using a very small knife similar in size to a paring knife.

3. Inaccurate illustration of position: Illustrations which do not show position clearly and exactly, when position is described in the text.

Page 298, "Children Everywhere"[1] presents the text: "Mattie Tucker stood by the gate - - - ".

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 110, shows Mattie standing on the gate with her feet between the wires.

4. Inaccurate illustration of color: Illustrations which do not show the exact colors described in the text.

Page 161, "If I Were Going"[2] presents the text: "Fisherman Jack was mending a hole in the dark red sail that belonged to his fishing boat."

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 162, shows an orange-colored sail.

5. Inaccurate word and story concepts: Illustrations which present inaccurate or incorrect ideas, which do not help clarify the words or ideas of the text, or which convey ideas which have little or no bearing on text content.

---

1. Yoakam, Gerald, Hester, Kathleen, Abney, Louise, Laidlaw Basic Readers, Laidlaw Bros., Inc., New York, 1947.

2. O'Donnell, Mabel, Reading Foundation Series: The New Alice and Jerry Books, Row, Peterson and Company, Evanston, Illinois, 1947.

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 48, shows a man using a very small knife similar in size to a paring knife.

3. Inaccurate illustration of position: Illustrations which do not show position clearly and exactly, when position is described in the text.

Page 208, "Children Everywhere"[1] presents the text: "Mattie Tucker stood by the gate - - - ".

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 110, shows Mattie standing on the gate with her feet between the wires.

4. Inaccurate illustration of color: Illustrations which do not show the exact colors described in the text.

Page 161, "If I Were Going"[2] presents the text: "Fisherman Jack was mending a hole in the dark red sail that belonged to his fishing boat."

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 182, shows an orange-colored sail.

5. Inaccurate word and story concept: Illustrations which present inaccurate or incorrect ideas, which do not help clarify the words or ideas of the text, or which convey ideas which have little or no bearing on text content.

---

1. Yoakam, Gerald, Hester, Kathleen, Abney, Louise, Laidlaw Basic Readers, Laidlaw Bros., Inc., New York, 1947.

2. O'Donnell, Mabel, Reading Foundation Series: The New Alice and Jerry Books, Row, Peterson and Company, Evanston, Illinois, 1947.

Page 113, "Streets and Roads"[1] presents the text: "They (children) hung stars on it (a Christmas tree) and put the biggest star on top."

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 69, shows a Christmas tree with ornaments but does not show the top of the tree nor the star.

6. Inaccurate illustration of statement of fact: Illustrations which by their content or appearance belie the statements of fact set forth in the text.

Page 186, "Streets and Roads"[2] presents the text: "He laughed until the tears ran down his face".

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 113, shows a man laughing but there are no tears running down his face.

7. Inaccurate illustration of real life situations: Illustrations which depict people, places, things or situations in a way which is not true to life.

Page 85 in "Finding New Neighbors"[3] presents the text: "She saw two bunnies sleeping in the grass, and a squirrel asleep in a tree by the roadside."

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 57, shows

---

1. Gray, William S. and Arbuthnot, Mary Hill, Basic Readers: Curriculum Foundation Series, Scott, Foresman and Company, New York, 1946-47.

2. Gray, William S. and Arbuthnot, Mary Hill, Basic Readers: Curriculum Foundation Series, Scott, Foresman and Company, New York, 1946-47.

3. Russell, David H., Wulfing, Gretchen, Ousley, Odille, The Ginn Basic Readers, Ginn and Company, New York, 1948.

Page 116, "Streets and Roads"[1] presents the text: "They (children) hung stars on it (a Christmas tree) and put the biggest star on top."

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 69, shows a Christmas tree with ornaments but does not show the top of the tree nor the star.

6. Inaccurate illustration of statement of fact:

Illustrations which by their content or appearance belie the statements of fact set forth in the text.

Page 138, "Streets and Roads"[2] presents the text: "He laughed until the tears ran down his face".

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 118, shows a man laughing but there are no tears running down his face.

7. Inaccurate illustration of real life situations:

Illustrations which depict people, places, things or situations in a way which is not true to life.

Page 85 in "Finding New Neighbors"[3] presents the text: "She saw two burros sleeping in the grass, and a squirrel asleep in a tree by the roadside."

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 57, shows

---

1. Gray, William S. and Arbuthnot, Mary Hill, Basic Readers: Curriculum Foundation Series, Book 1, Foresman and Company, New York, 1944-47.

2. Gray, William S. and Arbuthnot, Mary Hill, Basic Readers: Curriculum Foundation Series, Book 1, Foresman and Company, New York, 1944-47.

3. Russell, David H., Working, Gretchen, Conley, Odille, The Ginn Basic Readers, Ginn and Company, New York, 1942.

two bunnies sleeping on blue-colored grass.

8. Inaccurate illustration of people, places, or things: Illustrations which do not show people, places or things as they have been described in the text.

Page 233 in "Children Everywhere"[1] presents the text: "Soon he (Tan's father) pushed away some of the grass with his fingers and picked up the grasshopper."

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 91, shows the grasshopper to be perched on some leaves rather than in someone's hands.

9. Illustrations which are unrelated to the text: Illustrations which have no bearing on the text and no connection with it, but which are used merely for decoration.

Page 227 in "Children Everywhere"[2] presents a text concerned with two boys digging for worms.

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 89, shows two grasshoppers.

10. Illustrations which emphasize minor ideas, or only a portion of text content: Illustrations which enlarge on the incidental material of the text and neglect the main idea, or which neglect the text completely.

---

1. Yoakam, Gerald, Hester, Kathleen, Abney, Louise, Laidlaw Basic Readers, Laidlaw Bros., Inc., New York, 1947.

2. Yoakam, Gerald, Hester, Kathleen, Abney, Louise, Laidlaw Basic Readers, Laidlaw Bros., Inc., New York, 1947.

two bunnies sleeping on blue-colored grass.

8. Inaccurate illustration of people, places, or things:

Illustrations which do not show people, places or things as they have been described in the text.

Page 233 in "Children Everywhere"[1] presents the text: "Soon he (Tan's father) pushed away some of the grass with his fingers and picked up the grasshopper."

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 91, shows the grasshopper to be perched on some leaves rather than in someone's hands.

9. Illustrations which are unrelated to the text:

Illustrations which have no bearing on the text and no connection with it, but which are used merely for description.

Page 227 in "Children Everywhere"[2] presents a text concerned with two boys digging for worms.

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 89, shows two grasshoppers.

10. Illustrations which emphasize minor ideas, or only a portion of text content: Illustrations which enlarge on the incidental material of the text and neglect the main idea, or which neglect the text completely.

---

1. Yoakam, Gerald, Heater, Kathleen, Abney, Louise, Laidlaw Basic Readers, Laidlaw Bros., Inc., New York, 1947.

2. Yoakam, Gerald, Heater, Kathleen, Abney, Louise, Laidlaw Basic Readers, Laidlaw Bros., Inc., New York, 1947.

Page 37 in "If I Were Going"[1], presents a text concerned with three children who are playing a game.

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 37, shows a cow lying in the grass.

11. Illustrations placed before the text: The illustration which should accompany the text is sometimes placed a page or two before the text is given.

Page 306 in "If I Were Going"[2], presents a text concerning a little boy (Ali) who has gone to the market place to purchase a camel.

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 280, which shows Ali in the market place, is on page 305.

12. Illustrations placed after the text: Illustrations which should accompany a text are sometimes placed a page or two after the text is given.

Page 144 in "Finding New Neighbors",[3] presents a text concerned with an Indian girl (Blue Cornflower) looking out her window.

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 91, which shows Blue Cornflower at her window, is on page 145.

---

1. O'Donnell, Mabel, Reading Foundation Series: The New Alice and Jerry Books, Row, Peterson and Company, Evanston, Illinois, 1947.

2. O'Donnell, Mabel, Reading Foundation Series: The New Alice and Jerry Books, Row, Petersen and Company, Evanston, Illinois, 1947.

3. Russell, David H., Wulfing, Gretchen, Ousley, Odille, The Ginn Basic Readers, Ginn and Company, New York, 1948.

Page [illegible] in "If I Were Going"[1], presents a text concerned with three children who are playing a game.

The accompanying illustration, Illustration [illegible], shows a [illegible] in the game.

II. Illustrations placed before the text: The illustration which should accompany the text is sometimes placed a page or two before the text is given.

Page [illegible] in "If I Were Going", presents a text concerning a little boy (Bill) who has gone to the market place to purchase a meal.

The accompanying illustration, Illustration [illegible], which shows Bill in the market place, is on page [illegible].

III. Illustrations placed after the text: Illustrations which should accompany a text are sometimes placed a page or two after the text is given.

Page [illegible] in "Finding New Neighbors", presents a text concerned with an Indian girl (Blue Corn Flower) looking out her window.

The accompanying illustration, Illustration [illegible], shows Blue Corn Flower at her window, is on page [illegible].

---

1. O'Donnell, [illegible]. Reading Readiness Series: The Big Blue Jay Series Book. New York: Silver Burdett and Company, [illegible], Illinois, [illegible].

2. O'Donnell, [illegible]. Reading Foundation Series: The New Blue Jay Series Book. New York: Silver Burdett and Company, [illegible], Illinois, [illegible].

3. [illegible], [illegible]. [illegible]. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, The Blue Bird in Germany. Garden City: Doubleday, New York, [illegible].

13. Illustrations which lack clarity in general outline: Illustrations in which people, places, or things are not clear, obvious or easily recognizable by their all-over appearance and outline.

Page 8 in "Streets and Roads"[1] presents a text concerned with three baby robbins in a nest.

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 3, shows two robbins in a nest and a third object which might be a robbin but which is not easily recognizable as one.

14. Illustrations which give inadequate help or word recognition: Illustrations which do not take advantage of the opportunity to bring about more rapid and ready recognition of words whose form and meaning would be clarified by picture clues.

Page 211, in "Friends Far and Near"[2] presents a text concerning a Chinese boy (Chang Chee) drawing on rice paper with a special red crayon.

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 125, shows Chang Chee holding a white object, yet it contains no distinctive markings proving it to be rice paper.

15. Illustrations which show change within a unit: Illustrations in which a fixed object does not have

---

1. Gray, William S. and Arbuthnot, Mary Hill, Basic Readers: Curriculum Foundation Series, Scott, Foresman and Company, New York, 1946-47.

2. Russell, David H., Wulfing, Gretchen, Ousley, Odille, The Ginn Basic Readers, Ginn and Company, New York, 1948.

13. Illustrations which lack clarity in general outline:

Illustrations in which people, places, or things are not clear, obvious or easily recognizable by their all-over appearance and outline.

Page 8 in "Streets and Roads"[1] presents a text concerned with three baby robbins in a nest.

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 3, shows two robbins in a nest and a third object which might be a robbin but which is not easily recognizable as one.

14. Illustrations which give inadequate help or word recognition: Illustrations which do not take advantage of the opportunity to bring about more rapid and ready recognition of words whose form and meaning would be clarified by picture clues.

Page 211, in "Friends Far and Near"[2] presents a text concerning a Chinese boy (Chang Chee) drawing on rice paper with a special red crayon.

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 125, shows Chang Chee holding a white object, yet it contains no illustrative markings proving it to be rice paper.

15. Illustrations which show change within a unit:

Illustrations in which a fixed object does not have

---

1. Gray, William S. and Arbuthnot, Mary Hill. Basic Readers: Curriculum Foundation Series. Scott, Foresman and Company, New York, 1946-47.

2. Hassell, David H., Walling, Fletcher, Dooley, Odille. The Gum Basic Readers. Ginn and Company, New York, 1942.

exactly the same appearance or color each time it appears in a story unit, or in which there are changes pictured within the units of a book which are not required by the text.

Page 160 in "Friends Far and Near",[1] presents a text describing a baby whale named Sharp Ears because he could hear so well.

One of the accompanying illustrations, Illustration 95, shows Sharp Ears without his ears.

16. Illustrations which show results which should be expected from text content: Illustrations which depict circumstances which would follow necessarily as a result of the incident or the action described in the text.

Page 97 in "Streets and Roads"[2] presents the text:

"Pinky (a pig) wins the blue ribbon for the funniest trick" (said by one of the judges at the Spring City Fair).

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 59, shows Jim, Pinky's owner, pinning the blue ribbon on the pig.

After the analysis of the five basal reading series had been completed, the results were put in the form of a table. The errors found in each book were tabulated on individual tables - each table containing the number and page of each analyzed illustration. Every illustration to be analyzed

---

1. Russell, David H., Wulfing, Gretchen, Ousley, Odille, The Ginn Basic Readers, Ginn and Company, New York, 1948.

2. Gray, William S. and Arbuthnot, Mary Hill, Basic Readers: Curriculum Foundation Series, Scott, Foresman and Company, New York, 1946-47.

exactly the same appearance or color each time it appears in a story unit, or in which there are changes pictured within the units of a book which are not required by the text.

Page 180 in "Friends Far and Near",[1] presents a text describing a baby whale named Sharp Ears because he could hear so well.

One of the accompanying illustrations, Illustration 5a, shows Sharp Ears without his ears.

1c. Illustrations which show results which should be excepted from text content: Illustrations which depict circumstances which would follow necessarily as a result of the incident or the action described in the text.

Page 97 in "Streets and Roads"[2] presents the text:

"Pinky (a pig) wins the blue ribbon for the funniest trick" (said by one of the judges at the Spring City Fair).

The accompanying illustration, Illustration 6a, shows Jim, Pinky's owner, pinning the blue ribbon on the pig.

After the analysis of the five basal reading series had been completed, the results were put in the form of a table. The errors found in each book were tabulated on individual tables - each table containing the number and page of each analyzed illustration. Every illustration to be analyzed

---

1. Russell, David H., Walters, Gretchen, Cualey, Odille, The Sing Ready Readers, Ginn and Company, New York, 1949.

2. Gray, William S. and Arbuthnot, May Hill, Go to Read: Curriculum Foundation Series, Scott, Foresman and Company, New York, 1948-49.

was numbered. An illustration covering two pages was considered as one illustration. No illustrations were analyzed except those accompanied by text.

In addition to the table for each book, a table was constructed for each basal reading series, showing the total number and types of errors discovered in the series.

The final table which gives the number and type of errors discovered in each book included in the analysis was set up as summarization of the results of the study.

The results of the analysis are found in Chapter II, Analysis of Data.

was numbered. An illustration covering two pages was considered as one illustration. No illustrations were analyzed except those accompanied by text.

In addition to the table for each book, a table was constructed for each basal reading series, showing the total number and type of errors discovered in the series.

The final table which gives the number and type of errors discovered in each book included in the analysis was set up as summarization of the results of the study.

The results of the analysis are found in Chapter II, Analysis of Data.

CHAPTER II

ANALYSIS OF DATA

The purpose of this study was to analyze illustrations in basal reading systems for grade three for inaccuracies.

Five basal reading systems on the third grade level were analyzed and the results are shown in the series of tables found in this chapter.

Table I gives all information concerning title, author, publisher, reading series and copyright of the Third Readers used in the study in addition to the number of illustrations and pages analyzed in every book.

Tables II, III, V, VII, IX, XI, and XII contain data concerning the type and number of errors for each book, the page on which these inaccuracies occur and the number of the illustration to which they refer.

Tables VI, VIII, and X indicate the total errors found in each book included in the analysis.

Tables IV and XIII indicate the total errors found in the Ginn Basic Readers and the Curriculum Foundation Series respectively.

Finally, Table XIV gives a summary of the number of illustrations analyzed in the five basal series, and the number of errors found.

CHAPTER II

ANALYSIS OF DATA

The purpose of this study was to analyze illustrations in basal reading systems for grade three for inaccuracies.

Five basal reading systems on the third grade level were analyzed and the results are shown in the series of tables found in this chapter.

Table I gives all information concerning title, author, publisher, reading series and copyright of the Third Readers used in the study in addition to the number of illustrations and pages analyzed in every book.

Tables II, III, V, VII, IX, XI, and XII contain data concerning the type and number of errors for each book, the page on which these inaccuracies occur and the number of the illustration to which they refer.

Tables VI, VIII, and X indicate the total errors found in each book isolated in the analysis.

Tables IV and XIII indicate the total errors found in the <u>Ginn Basic Readers</u> and the <u>Curriculum Foundation Series</u> respectively.

Finally, Table XIV gives a summary of the number of illustrations analyzed in the five basal series, and the number of errors found.

TABLE I

THIRD READERS USED IN THE STUDY

BASIC READING SERIES	NAME OF BOOK	PUBLISHER	AUTHORS	COPYRIGHT	NUMBER OF PAGES	NUMBER OF ILLUSTRATIONS
Ginn Basic Readers	T L/ 1 Finding New Neighbors	Ginn and Company	Russell, Wulfing Ousley	1948	315	183
	T L/2 Friends Far and Near	Ginn and Company	Russell, Wulfing	1948	315	191
Laidlaw Basic Readers	Children Everywhere	Laidlaw Bros., Inc.	Hoakam, Hester, Abney	1947	313	114
Today's Work-Play Books	On Longer Trails	The Macmillan Company	Gates, Huber, Peardon, Salisbury	1945	337	160
Reading Foundation Series	If I Were Going	Row, Peterson and Company	O'Donnell	1948	337	308
Curriculum Foundation Series	T L/1 Streets and Roads	Scott, Foresman and Company	Gray, Arbuthnot	1946-1947	315	193
	T L/2 More Streets and Roads	Scott, Foresman and Company	Gray, Arbuthnot	1946-1947	313	256

TABLE II

FINDING NEW NEIGHBORS - THIRD READER - LEVEL 1 - GINN BASIC READERS

CHECK LIST FOR INACCURACIES	ILLUSTRATIONS, BY NUMBER AND PAGE, IN WHICH INACCURACIES OCCUR																																									TOTAL
Number	3	5	13	17	20	34	36	39	41	42	47	56	57	60	72	80	82	83	85	87	91	92	95	102	103	106	108	123	148	149	152	156	159	165	168	170	182					
Page	8	10	20	24	28	47	51	55	59	60	69	84	85	89	105	119	131	132	136	138	145	147	151	163	164	171	174	203	251	253	258	265	270	283	288	291	313					
1. Inaccurate Illustration of Action Words	X									X					X																											3
2. Inaccurate Illustration of Size Concepts									X								X												X													3
3. Inaccurate Illustration of Position																																										0
4. Inaccurate Illustration of Color																						X	X									X				X						4
5. Inaccurate Word and Story Concepts																											X							X								2
6. Inaccurate Illustration of Statement of Fact					X			X											X											X												4
7. Inaccurate Illustration of Real Life Situation													X	X																												2
8. Inaccurate Illustration of People, Places, Things		X				X		X																X								X					X					6
9. Illustrations Which are Unrelated to the Text																																										0
10. Illustrations which Emphasize Minor Ideas or Only a Portion of Text Content			X	X			X				X							X																	X							6

TABLE II (CONTINUED)

FINDING NEW NEIGHBORS - THIRD READER - LEVEL 1 - GINN BASIC READERS

CHECK LIST FOR INACCURACIES	ILLUSTRATIONS, BY NUMBER AND PAGE, IN WHICH INACCURACIES OCCUR																																				TOTAL
Number	3	5	13	17	20	34	36	39	41	42	47	56	57	60	72	80	82	83	85	87	91	92	95	102	103	106	108	123	148	149	152	156	159	165	168	170	182	
Page	8	10	20	24	28	47	51	55	59	60	69	84	85	89	105	119	131	132	136	138	145	147	151	163	164	171	174	203	251	253	258	265	270	283	288	291	313	
11. Illustrations Placed Before the Text																X												X										2
12. Illustrations Placed After the Text																					X					X												2
13. Illustrations Which Lack Clarity in General Outline																				X					X													2
14. Illustrations Which Give Inadequate Help on Word Recognition												X																										1
15. Illustrations Which Show Change Within a Unit																																						0
16. Illustrations Which Show Results Which Should be Expected from Text Content																															X							1
																																						38

TABLE III

FRIENDS FAR AND NEAR - THIRD READER - LEVEL B - GINN BASIC READERS

CHECK LIST FOR INACCURACIES	ILLUSTRATIONS, BY NUMBER AND PAGE, IN WHICH INACCURACIES OCCUR																															TOTAL
Number	10	12	32	34	36	37	43	48	52	59	61	65	75	84	91	92	93	95	105	110	116	125	127	137	141	154	157	159	166	171	187	
Page	21	24	61	65	68	70	77	84	92	105	108	114	134	147	156	157	159	163	179	188	196	211	214	231	238	259	261	265	276	280	307	
1. Inaccurate Illustration of Action Words		X																														1
2. Inaccurate Illustration of Size Concepts								X																								1
3. Inaccurate Illustration of Position																																
4. Inaccurate Illustration of Color				X										X																		2
5. Inaccurate Word and Story Concepts	X				X																		X									3
6. Inaccurate Illustration of Statement of Fact											X																			X		2
7. Inaccurate Illustration of Real Life Situation																																
8. Inaccurate Illustration of People, Places, Things						X											X				X											3
9. Illustrations Which are Unrelated to the Text							X																									1
10. Illustrations Which Emphasize Minor Ideas or Only a Portion of Text Content			X						X	X		X			X	X									X		X					8

TABLE III (CONTINUED)

FRIENDS FAR AND NEAR - THIRD READER - LEVEL 2 - GINN BASIC READERS

CHECK LIST FOR INACCURACIES	ILLUSTRATIONS, BY NUMBER AND PAGE, IN WHICH INACCURACIES OCCUR																															TOTAL
	Number	10	12	32	34	36	37	43	48	52	59	61	65	75	84	91	92	93	95	105	110	116	125	127	137	141	154	157	159	166	171	187	
	Page	21	24	61	65	68	70	77	84	92	105	108	114	134	147	156	157	159	163	179	188	196	211	214	231	238	259	261	265	276	280	307	
11. Illustrations Placed Before the Text																									X								1
12. Illustrations Placed After the Text																																	
13. Illustrations Which Lack Clarity in General Outline																																	
14. Illustrations Which Give Inadequate Help on Word Recognition														X									X										2
15. Illustrations Which Show Change Within a Unit																			X														1
16. Illustrations Which Show Results Which Should be Expected from Text Content																				X	X						X		X	X		X	6
																																	31

TABLE IV

TOTAL INACCURACIES OCCURRING IN THE GINN BASIC READERS

CHECK LIST FOR INACCURACIES	$T^{L}/1$ FINDING NEW NEIGHBORS	$T^{L}/2$ FRIENDS FAR AND NEAR	TOTAL
Inaccurate Illustration of Action Words	3	1	4
Inaccurate Illustration of Size Concepts	3	1	4
Inaccurate Illustration of Position	0	0	0
Inaccurate Illustration of Color-	4	2	6
Inaccurate Word and Story Concepts	2	3	5
Inaccurate Illustration of Statement of Fact	4	2	6
Inaccurate Illustration of Real Life Situation	2	0	2
Inaccurate Illustration of People, Places, Things	6	3	9
Illustrations Which are Unrelated to Text	0	1	1
Illustrations Which Emphasize Minor Ideas or Only a Portion of Text Content	6	8	14
Illustrations Placed Before the Text	2	1	3
Illustrations Placed After the Text	2	0	2
Illustrations Which Lack Clarity in General Outline	2	0	2
Illustrations Which Give Inadequate Help or Word Recognition	1	2	3
Illustrations Which Show Change Within a Unit	0	1	1
Illustrations Which Show Results Which Should be Expected from Text Content	1	6	7
TOTAL	38	31	69

TABLE V

CHILDREN EVERYWHERE - THIRD READER - LAIDLAW BASIC READERS

CHECK LIST FOR INACCURACIES	ILLUSTRATIONS, BY NUMBER AND PAGE, IN WHICH INACCURACIES OCCUR																		TOTAL
Number	4	14	18	23	34	35	40	43	49	72	88	89	91	95	102	104	110	113	
Page	12	42	57	75	111	116	136	145	169	177	221	227	233	252	272	280	298	312	
1. Inaccurate Illustration of Action Words		X																	1
2. Inaccurate Illustration of Size Concepts																			
3. Inaccurate Illustration of Position																	X		1
4. Inaccurate Illustration of Color							X												1
5. Inaccurate Word and Story Concepts																			
6. Inaccurate Illustration of Statement of Fact																			
7. Inaccurate Illustration of Real Life Situation										X									1
8. Inaccurate Illustration of People, Places, Things													X						1
9. Illustrations Which are Unrelated to Text								X				X			X				3
10. Illustrations Which Emphasize Minor Ideas or Only a Portion of Text Content					X														1

TABLE V (CONTINUED)

CHILDREN EVERYWHERE - THIRD READER - LAIDLAW BASIC READERS

CHECK LIST FOR INACCURACIES	ILLUSTRATIONS, BY NUMBER AND PAGE, IN WHICH INACCURACIES OCCUR																		TOTAL
Number	4	14	18	23	34	35	40	43	49	72	88	89	91	95	102	104	110	113	
Page	12	42	57	75	111	116	136	145	169	177	221	227	233	252	272	280	298	312	
11. Illustrations Placed Before the Text	X	X	X			X			X		X	X		X	X				9
12. Illustrations Placed After the Text																			
13. Illustrations Which Lack Clarity in General Outline																			
14. Illustrations Which Give Inadequate Help on Word Recognition																			
15. Illustrations Which Show Change Within a Unit																			
16. Illustrations Which Show Results Which Should be Expected from Text of Content																		X	1
																			19

TABLE VI

TOTAL INACCURACIES OCCURRING IN THE LAIDLAW BASIC READERS

CHECK LIST FOR INACCURACIES	CHILDREN EVERYWHERE	TOTAL
Inaccurate Illustration of Action Words		1
Inaccurate Illustration of Size Concepts		0
Inaccurate Illustration of Position		1
Inaccurate Illustration of Color		1
Inaccurate Word and Story Concepts		0
Inaccurate Illustration of Statement of Fact		0
Inaccurate Illustration of Real Life Situation		1
Inaccurate Illustration of People, Places, Things		1
Illustrations Which are Unrelated to Text		3
Illustrations Which Emphasize Minor Ideas or Only a Portion of Text Content		1
Illustrations Placed before the Text		9
Illustrations Placed After the Text		0
Illustrations Which Lack Clarity in General Outline		0
Illustrations Which Give Inadequate Help on Word Recognition		0
Illustrations Which Show Change Within a Unit		0
Illustrations Which Show Results Which Should be Expected from Text Content		1
		19

TABLE VII

ON LONGER TRAILS - THIRD READER - TODAY'S WORK-PLAY BOOKS

CHECK LIST FOR INACCURACIES	ILLUSTRATIONS, BY NUMBER AND PAGE, IN WHICH INACCURACIES OCCUR																																			TOTAL
	Number	17	20	21	22	23	38	45	46	51	54	55	63	67	69	72	73	74	75	76	79	82	86	93	97	101	105	106	109	111	113	116	129	141	147	150	
	Page	33	39	41	43	46	70	80	82	93	99	101	121	133	138	144	147	149	152	153	158	163	170	180	187	196	205	207	213	216	222	228	253	284	301	309	
1. Inaccurate Illustration of Action Words													X												X												2
2. Inaccurate Illustration of Size Concepts																																					
3. Inaccurate Illustration of Position			X																X																		2
4. Inaccurate Illustration of Color			X	X														X		X	X											X		X			7
5. Inaccurate Word and Story Concepts															X																						1
6. Inaccurate Illustration of Statement of Fact		X								X	X						X																X				5
7. Inaccurate Illustration of Real Life Situation																																					
8. Inaccurate Illustration of People, Places, Things														X																							1
9. Illustrations Which are Unrelated to Text									X			X											X														3
10. Illustrations Which Emphasize Minor Ideas or only a Portion of Text Content						X	X																						X								3

TABLE VII (CONTINUED)

ON LONGER TRAILS - THIRD READER - TODAY'S WORK-PLAY BOOKS

| CHECK LIST FOR INACCURACIES | ILLUSTRATIONS, BY NUMBER AND PAGE, IN WHICH INACCURACIES OCCUR | | |

TABLE VIII

TOTAL INACCURACIES OCCURRING IN TODAY'S WORK-PLAY BOOKS

CHECK LIST FOR INACCURACIES	ON LONGER TRAILS	TOTAL
Inaccurate Illustration of Action Words		2
Inaccurate Illustration of Size Concepts		0
Inaccurate Illustration of Position		2
Inaccurate Illustration of Color		7
Inaccurate Word and Story Concept		1
Inaccurate Illustration of Statement of Fact		5
Inaccurate Illustration of Real Life Situation		0
Inaccurate Illustration of People, Places, Things		1
Illustrations Which are Unrelated to Text		3
Illustrations Which Emphasize Minor Ideas or Only a Portion of Text Content		3
Illustrations Placed Before the Text		5
Illustrations Placed After the Text		6
Illustrations Which Lack Clarity in General Outline		1
Illustrations Which Give Inadequate Help on Word Recognition		0
Illustrations Which Show Change Within a Unit		3
Illustrations Which Show Results Which Should be Expected from Text Content		3
		42

TABLE IX

IF I WERE GOING - THIRD READER - READING FOUNDATION SERIES

CHECK LIST FOR INACCURACIES	ILLUSTRATIONS, BY NUMBER AND PAGE, IN WHICH INACCURACIES OCCUR										TOTAL
Number	9	19	30	37	112	146	162	211	280	284	
Page	9	20	29	37	128	148	161	221	305	309	
1. Inaccurate Illustration of Action Words	X										1
2. Inaccurate Illustration of Size Concepts											
3. Inaccurate Illustration of Position											
4. Inaccurate Illustration of Color			X			X	X				3
5. Inaccurate Word and Story Concepts											
6. Inaccurate Illustration of Statement of Fact								X			1
7. Inaccurate Illustration of Real Life Situation											
8. Inaccurate Illustration of People, Places, Things					X						1
9. Illustrations Which are Unrelated to the Text											
10. Illustrations Which Emphasize Minor Ideas or Only a Portion of Text Content		X		X							2

TABLE IX (CONTINUED)

IF I WERE GOING - THIRD READER - READING FOUNDATION SERIES

CHECK LIST FOR INACCURACIES	ILLUSTRATIONS, BY NUMBER AND PAGE, IN WHICH INACCURACIES OCCUR										TOTAL
Number	9	19	30	37	112	146	162	211	280	284	
Page	9	20	29	37	128	148	161	221	305	309	
11. Illustrations Placed Before the Text									X	X	2
12. Illustrations Placed After the Text											
13. Illustrations Which Lack Clarity in General Outline											
14. Illustrations Which Give Inadequate Help on Word Recognition											
15. Illustrations Which Show Change Within a Unit					X						1
16. Illustrations Which Show Results Which Should be Expected from Text Content											
											11

TABLE X

TOTAL INACCURACIES OCCURRING IN THE READING FOUNDATION SERIES

CHECK LIST FOR INACCURACIES	IF I WERE GOING	TOTAL
Inaccurate Illustration of Action Words		1
Inaccurate Illustration of Size Concepts		0
Inaccurate Illustration of Position		0
Inaccurate Illustration of Color		3
Inaccurate Word and Story Concepts		0
Inaccurate Illustration of Statement of Fact		1
Inaccurate Illustration of Real Life Situation		0
Inaccurate Illustration of People, Places, Things		1
Illustrations Which are Unrelated to Text		0
Illustrations Which Emphasize Minor Ideas or Only a Portion of Text Content		2
Illustrations Placed Before the Text		2
Illustrations Placed After the Text		0
Illustrations Which Lack Clarity in General Outline		0
Illustrations Which Give Inadequate Help on Word Recognition		0
Illustrations Which Show Change Within a Unit		1
Illustrations Which Show Results Which Should be Expected From Text Content		0
		11

TABLE XI

STREETS AND ROADS - THIRD READER - LEVEL 1 - CURRICULUM FOUNDATION SERIES

CHECK LIST FOR INACCURACIES	ILLUSTRATIONS, BY NUMBER AND PAGE, IN WHICH INACCURACIES OCCUR									TOTAL
Number	3	5	14	39	59	69	98	113	178	
Page	8	12	25	66	97	113	163	186	289	
1. Inaccurate Illustration of Action Words										
2. Inaccurate Illustration of Size Concepts										
3. Inaccurate Illustration of Position										
4. Inaccurate Illustration of Color										
5. Inaccurate Word and Story Concepts			X			X				2
6. Inaccurate Illustration of Statement of Fact							X	X		2
7. Inaccurate Illustration of Real Life Situation										
8. Inaccurate Illustration of People, Places, Things						X				1
9. Illustrations Which are Unrelated to the Text										
10. Illustrations Which Emphasize Minor Ideas or Only a Portion of Text Content										

TABLE XI (CONTINUED)

STREETS AND ROADS - THIRD READER - LEVEL 1 - CURRICULUM FOUNDATION SERIES

CHECK LIST FOR INACCURACIES	ILLUSTRATIONS, BY NUMBER AND PAGE, IN WHICH INACCURACIES OCCUR									TOTAL
	Number	3	5	14	39	59	69	98	113	178	
	Page	8	12	25	66	97	113	163	186	289	
11. Illustrations Placed Before the Text											
12. Illustrations Placed After the Text											
13. Illustrations Which Lack Clarity in General Outline		X									1
14. Illustrations Which Give Inadequate Help on Word Recognition											
15. Illustrations Which Show Change Within a Unit					X						1
16. Illustrations Which Show Results Which Should be Expected from Text Content						X			X		2
											9

TABLE XII

MORE STREETS AND ROADS - THIRD READER - LEVEL 2 - CURRICULUM FOUNDATION SERIES

CHECK LIST FOR INACCURACIES	ILLUSTRATIONS, BY NUMBER AND PAGE, IN WHICH INACCURACIES OCCUR									TOTAL
Number	13	20	27	49	64	68	82	123	235	
Page	24	37	49	95	127	137	166	246	275	
1. Inaccurate Illustration of Action Words					X	X		X		3
2. Inaccurate Illustration of Size Concepts										
3. Inaccurate Illustration of Position										
4. Inaccurate Illustration of Color	X		X							2
5. Inaccurate Word and Story Concepts					X					1
6. Inaccurate Illustration of Statement of Fact							X			1
7. Inaccurate Illustration of Real Life Situation										
8. Inaccurate Illustration of People, Places, Things										
9. Illustrations Which are Unrelated to Text										
10. Illustrations Which Emphasize Minor Ideas or Only a Portion of Text Content										

TABLE XII (CONTINUED)

MORE STREETS AND ROADS - THIRD READER - LEVEL 2 - CURRICULUM FOUNDATION SERIES

CHECK LIST FOR INACCURACIES	ILLUSTRATIONS, BY NUMBER AND PAGE, IN WHICH INACCURACIES OCCUR									TOTAL
Number	13	20	27	49	64	68	82	123	235	
Page	24	37	49	95	137	137	166	246	275	
11. Illustrations Placed Before the Text				X						1
12. Illustrations Placed After the Text										
13. Illustrations Which Lack Clarity in General Outline										
14. Illustrations Which Give Inadequate Help on Word Recognition										
15. Illustrations Which Show Change Within a Unit										
16. Illustrations Which Show Results Which Should be Expected from Text Content		X							X	2
										10

TABLE XIII

TOTAL INACCURACIES OCCURRING IN THE CURRICULUM FOUNDATION SERIES

CHECK LIST FOR INACCURACIES	T L/1 STREETS AND ROADS	T L/2 MORE STREETS AND ROADS	TOTAL
Inaccurate Illustration of Action Words		3	3
Inaccurate Illustration of Size Concepts			0
Inaccurate Illustration of Position			0
Inaccurate Illustration of Color		2	2
Inaccurate Word and Story Concepts	2	1	3
Inaccurate Illustration of Statement of Fact	2	1	3
Inaccurate Illustration of Real Life Situation			0
Inaccurate Illustration of People, Places, Things	1		1
Illustrations Which are Unrelated to the Text			0
Illustrations Which Emphasize Minor Ideas or Only a Portion of Text Content			0
Illustrations Placed Before the Text		1	1
Illustrations Placed After the Text			0
Illustrations Which Lack Clarity in General Outline	1		1
Illustrations Which Give Inadequate Help on Word Recognition			0
Illustrations Which Show Change Within a Unit	1		1
Illustrations Which Show Results Which Should be Expected from Text Content	2	2	4
TOTAL	9	10	19

TABLE XIV

SUMMARY OF ILLUSTRATIONS AND INACCURACIES

IN THE FIVE BASAL SERIES EXAMINED IN THE STUDY

	ILLUSTRATIONS	INACCURACIES
Ginn Basic Readers	374	69
Laidlaw Basic Readers	114	19
Today's Work-Play Books	160	42
Reading Foundation Series	308	11
Curriculum Foundation Series	449	19
TOTAL	1405	160

CHAPTER III

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

The basal reading system is an integral part of the elementary school program. The carefully graded vocabulary and unit gradation of the texts have aided teachers tremendously in planning the reading program. As has been seen, however, by previous research and study, illustrations also play their part in the effectiveness of a reading program. The prime purpose of the illustration is to act as an aid in understanding vocabulary, and to enrich word meaning. With this purpose in mind, the writer feels that illustrators should take great care in avoiding inaccuracies integrating the illustration with the text, and in creating a colorful yet meaningful picture so that the child may derive genuine satisfaction and understanding from his reading.

This study was undertaken to examine the inaccuracies which occur in illustrations in basal reading series and to determine the type and frequency of errors.

The conclusions reached are as follows:

1. Out of 1405 analyzed, 160, or 11.5 per cent, were found to contain inaccuracies.

2. The inaccuracies which occurred with the greatest frequency in the entire series were Illustrations Which Emphasize Minor Ideas or Only a Portion of Text Content and

CHAPTER III

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

The basal reading system is an integral part of the elementary school program. The carefully graded vocabulary and unit gradation of the texts have aided teachers tremendously in planning the reading program. As has been seen, however, by previous research and study, illustrations also play their part in the effectiveness of a reading program. The prime purpose of the illustration is to act as an aid in understanding vocabulary, and to enrich word meaning. With this purpose in mind, the writer feels that illustrators should take great care in avoiding inaccuracies interpreting the illustration with the text, and in presenting a colorful yet meaningful picture so that the child may derive genuine satisfaction and understanding from his reading.

This study was undertaken to examine the inaccuracies which occur in illustrations in basal reading series and to determine the type and frequency of errors.

The conclusions reached are as follows:

1. Out of 1425 analyzed, 150, or 11.5 per cent, were found to contain inaccuracies.

2. The inaccuracies which occurred with the greatest frequency in the entire series were <u>Illustrations Which Emphasize Minor Ideas or Only a Portion of Text Content</u> and

Illustrations Placed Before the Text. The individual totals for these were:

Illustrations Which Emphasize Minor Ideas or Only a Portion of Text Content		
Ginn Basic Readers	14	
Laidlaw Basic Readers	1	
Today's Work-Play Books	3	
Reading Foundation Series	2	
Curriculum Foundation Series	0	
	20	Total

Illustrations Placed Before the Text		
Ginn Basic Readers	3	
Laidlaw Basic Readers	9	
Today's Work-Play Books	5	
Reading Foundation Series	2	
Curriculum Foundation Series	1	
	20	Total

3. The inaccuracies which occurred with the least frequency in the entire series were Inaccurate Illustration of Position, Inaccurate Illustration of Real Life Situations and Illustrations Which Give Inadequate Help on Word Recognition. The first occurred three (3) times, once in the Laidlaw Basic Readers and twice in Today's Work-Play Books. Inaccurate Illustration of Real Life Situations occurred three (3) times, twice in the Ginn Basic Readers and once in the Laidlaw Basic Readers. Illustrations Which Give Inadequate Help on Word Recognition occurred three (3) times in the Ginn Basic Readers.

Illustrations Placed Before the Text. The individual totals for these were:

Illustrations Which Emphasize Minor Ideas or Only a Portion of Text Content	
Ginn Basic Readers	14
Laidlaw Basic Readers	1
Today's Work-Play Books	3
Reading Foundation Series	2
Curriculum Foundation Series	0
Total	20

Illustrations Placed Before the Text	
Ginn Basic Readers	3
Laidlaw Basic Readers	9
Today's Work-Play Books	5
Reading Foundation Series	2
Curriculum Foundation Series	1
Total	20

6. The inaccuracies which occurred with the least frequency in the entire series were Inaccurate Illustration of Position, Inaccurate Illustration of Real Life Situations and Illustrations Which Give Inaccurate Help on Word Recognition. The first occurred three (3) times, once in the Laidlaw Basic Readers and twice in Today's Work-Play Books. Inaccurate Illustration of Real Life Situations occurred three (3) times, twice in the Ginn Basic Readers and once in the Laidlaw Basic Readers. Illustrations Which Give Inaccurate Help on Word Recognition occurred three (3) times in the Ginn Basic Readers.

4. The inaccuracy which occurred with the greatest frequency in an individual series was Illustrations Which Emphasize Minor Ideas or Only a Portion of Text Content which occurred fourteen (14) times in the Ginn Basic Readers.

5. The inaccuracy which occurred the second highest number of times in an individual series was Inaccurate Illustrations of People, Places or Things which occurred nine (9) times in the Ginn Basic Readers.

The individual totals for the occurrence of Inaccurate Illustrations of People, Places or Things were:

Ginn Basic Readers	9	
Laidlaw Basic Readers	1	
Today's Work-Play Books	1	
Reading Foundation Series	1	
Curriculum Foundation Series	1	
	13	Total

6. The inaccuracy which occurred the third highest number of times in an individual series was Illustrations Which Show Results Which Should Be Expected From Text Content which occurred seven (7) times in the Ginn Basic Readers. The individual totals for the occurrence of Illustrations Which Show Results Which Should Be Expected From Text Content were:

Ginn Basic Readers	7
Laidlaw Basic Readers	1
Today's Work-Play Books	3
Reading Foundation Series	0

4. The inaccuracy which occurred with the greatest frequency in an individual series was Illustrations Which Emphasize Minor Ideas or Only a Portion of Text Content which occurred fourteen (14) times in the Ginn Basic Readers.

5. The inaccuracy which occurred the second highest number of times in an individual series was Inaccurate Illustrations of People, Places or Things which occurred nine (9) times in the Ginn Basic Readers.

The individual totals for the occurrence of Inaccurate Illustrations of People, Places or Things were:

Ginn Basic Readers	9
Laidlaw Basic Readers	1
Today's Work-Play Books	1
Reading Foundation Series	1
Curriculum Foundation Series	1
Total	13

6. The inaccuracy which occurred the third highest number of times in an individual series was Illustrations Which Show Results Which Should Be Expected From Text Content which occurred seven (7) times in the Ginn Basic Readers. The individual totals for the occurrence of Illustrations Which Show Results Which Should Be Expected From Text Content were:

Ginn Basic Readers	7
Laidlaw Basic Readers	1
Today's Work-Play Books	3
Reading Foundation Series	0

Curriculum Foundation Series $\frac{4}{15}$ Total

7. Certain inaccuracies on the check list for Inaccuracies did not occur at all in some of the basic readers examined.

a. Inaccurate Illustration of Size Concepts did not occur at all in the following series:

Laidlaw Basic Readers

Today's Work-Play Books

Reading Foundation Series

Curriculum Foundation Series

b. Inaccurate Illustration of Position did not occur at all in the following series:

Ginn Basic Readers

Reading Foundation Series

Curriculum Foundation Series

c. Inaccurate Word and Story Concepts did not occur at all in the following series:

Reading Foundation Series

d. Inaccurate Illustration of Statement of Fact did not occur at all in the following series:

Laidlaw Basic Readers

e. Inaccurate Illustration of Real Life Situations did not occur at all in the following series:

Today's Work-Play Books

Reading Foundation Series

Curriculum Foundation Series

Curriculum Foundation Series $\frac{4}{15}$ Total

7. Certain inaccuracies on the check list for Inaccuracies did not occur at all in some of the basic readers examined.

a. Inaccurate Illustration of Size Concepts

did not occur at all in the following series:

Laidlaw Basic Readers

Today's Work-Play Books

Reading Foundation Series

Curriculum Foundation Series

b. Inaccurate Illustration of Position

did not occur at all in the following series:

Ginn Basic Readers

Reading Foundation Series

Curriculum Foundation Series

c. Inaccurate Word and Story Concepts

did not occur at all in the following series:

Reading Foundation Series

d. Inaccurate Illustration of Statement of Fact

did not occur at all in the following series:

Laidlaw Basic Readers

e. Inaccurate Illustration of Real Life Situations

did not occur at all in the following series:

Today's Work-Play Books

Reading Foundation Series

Curriculum Foundation Series

f. Illustrations Which Are Unrelated to the Text did not occur at all in the following series:

Reading Foundation Series

Curriculum Foundation Series

g. Illustrations Which Emphasize Minor Ideas or Only a Portion of Text Content did not occur at all in the following series:

Curriculum Foundation Series

h. Illustrations Placed After the Text did not occur at all in the following series:

Laidlaw Basic Readers

Reading Foundation Series

Curriculum Foundation Series

i. Illustrations Which Lack Clarity in General Outline did not occur at all in the following series:

Laidlaw Basic Readers

Reading Foundation Series

j. Illustrations Which Give Inadequate Help on Word Recognition did not occur at all in the following series:

Laidlaw Basic Readers

Today's Work-Play Books

Reading Foundation Series

Curriculum Foundation Series

k. Illustrations Which Show Change Within a Unit did not occur at all in the following series:

Laidlaw Basic Readers

r. Illustrations Which Are Unrelated to the Text did not occur at all in the following series:

Reading Foundation Series

Curriculum Foundation Series

s. Illustrations Which Emphasize Minor Ideas or Only a Portion of Text Content did not occur at all in the following series:

Curriculum Foundation Series

n. Illustrations Placed After the Text did not occur at all in the following series:

Laidlaw Basic Readers

Reading Foundation Series

Curriculum Foundation Series

i. Illustrations Which Lack Clarity in General Outline did not occur at all in the following series:

Laidlaw Basic Readers

Reading Foundation Series

j. Illustrations Which Give Inadequate Help on Word Recognition did not occur at all in the following series:

Laidlaw Basic Readers

Today's Work-Play Books

Reading Foundation Series

Curriculum Foundation Series

k. Illustrations Which Show Groups Within a Unit did not occur at all in the following series:

Laidlaw Basic Readers

1. Illustrations Which Show Results Which Should Be Expected From Text Content did not occur at all in the following series:

Reading Foundation Series

8. The greatest number of inaccuracies, sixty-nine (69), occurred in the Ginn Basic Readers. This series contained two (2) readers. The greatest number of inaccuracies in a series which contained only one basic reader was forty-two (42) which occurred in Today's Work-Play Books. The fewest number of inaccuracies, eleven (11), occurred in the Reading Foundation Series. The total number of inaccuracies for each of the five basal reading series examined is as follows:

Ginn Basic Readers	69	
Today's Work-Play Books	42	
Laidlaw Basic Readers	19	
Curriculum Foundation Series	19	
Reading Foundation Series	11	
	160	Total

9. The following are the major inaccuracies which occurred in each series:

Ginn Basic Readers

Illustrations Which Emphasize Minor Ideas or Only a Portion of Text Content	14
Inaccurate Illustrations of People, Places, or Things	9
Illustrations Which Show Results Which Should be Expected from Text Content	7

1. Illustrations Which Show Results Which Should Be Expected from Text Content did not occur at all in the following series:

Reading Foundation Series

8. The greatest number of inaccuracies, sixty-nine (69), occurred in the Ginn Basic Readers. This series contained two (2) readers. The greatest number of inaccuracies in a series which contained only one basic reader was forty-two (42) which occurred in Today's Work-Play Books. The fewest number of inaccuracies, eleven (11), occurred in the Reading Foundation Series. The total number of inaccuracies for each of the five basal reading series examined is as follows:

Ginn Basic Readers	69
Today's Work-Play Books	42
Laidlaw Basic Readers	15
Curriculum Foundation Series	13
Reading Foundation Series	11
Total	150

9. The following are the major inaccuracies which occurred in each series:

Ginn Basic Readers

Illustrations Which Exaggerate Minor Ideas or Only a Portion of Text Content	16
Inaccurate Illustrations of People, Places, or Things	9
Illustrations Which Show Results Which Should Be Expected from Text Content	7

Inaccurate Illustration of Statement of Fact	6
Inaccurate Word and Story Concepts	5
Inaccurate Illustration of Action Words	4
Inaccurate Illustration of Size Concepts	4

All other inaccuracies in this series occurred less than three (3) times.

Laidlaw Basic Readers

Illustrations Placed Before the Text	9
Illustrations Which are Unrelated to the Text	3

All other inaccuracies in this series occurred only once.

Today's Work-Play Books

Inaccurate Illustration of Color	7
Illustrations Placed After the Text	6
Illustrations Placed Before the Text	5
Illustrations Which are Unrelated to the Text	3
Illustrations Which Emphasize Minor Ideas or Only a Portion of Text Content	3
Illustrations Which Show Change Within a Unit	3
Illustrations Which Show Results Which Should be Expected From Text Content	3

All other inaccuracies in this series occurred two (2) times or less.

Reading Foundation Series

Inaccurate Illustration of Color	3
Illustrations Which Emphasize Minor Ideas or Only a Portion of Text Content	2
Illustrations Placed Before the Text	2

Inaccurate Illustration of Statement of Fact 6

Inaccurate Word and Story Concepts 5

Inaccurate Illustration of Action Words 4

Inaccurate Illustration of Size Concepts 4

All other inaccuracies in this series occurred less than three (3) times.

Laidlaw Basic Readers

Illustrations Placed Before the Text 9

Illustrations Which are Unrelated to the Text 3

All other inaccuracies in this series occurred only once.

Today's Work-Play Books

Inaccurate Illustration of Color 7

Illustrations Placed After the Text 6

Illustrations Placed Before the Text 3

Illustrations Which are Unrelated to the Text 3

Illustrations Which Emphasize Minor Ideas or Only a Portion of Text Content 3

Illustrations Which Show Changes Within a Unit 3

Illustrations Which Show Results Which Should be Inferred from Text Content 3

All other inaccuracies in this series occurred two (2) times or less.

Ginn's Foundation Series

Inaccurate Illustration of Color 6

Illustrations Which Emphasize Minor Ideas or Only a Portion of Text Content 3

Illustrations Placed Before the Text 3

All other inaccuracies in this series occurred only once.

Curriculum Foundation Series

Illustrations Which Show Results Which Should be Expected From Text Content	4
Inaccurate Illustration of Action Words	3
Inaccurate Word and Story Concepts	3
Inaccurate Illustration of Statement of Fact	3

All other inaccuracies in this series occurred two (2) times or less.

10. The Ginn Basic Readers showed inaccuracies in fifteen (15) items of the check list.

The Laidlaw Basic Readers showed inaccuracies in nine (9) items of the check list.

Today's Work-Play Books showed inaccuracies in thirteen (13) items of the check list.

The Reading Foundation Series showed inaccuracies in seven (7) items of the check list.

The Curriculum Foundation Series showed inaccuracies in nine (9) items of the check list.

All other inaccuracies in this series occurred only once.

Curriculum Foundation Series

Illustrations Which Show Results Which Should be Created From Text Content	4
Inaccurate Illustration of Action Words	3
Inaccurate Word and Story Concepts	3
Inaccurate Illustration of Statement of Fact	3

All other inaccuracies in this series occurred two (2) times or less.

10. The Ginn Basic Readers showed inaccuracies in fifteen (15) items of the check list.

The Laidlaw Basic Readers showed inaccuracies in nine (9) items of the check list.

Today's Work-Play Books showed inaccuracies in thirteen (13) items of the check list.

The Reading Foundation Series showed inaccuracies in seven (7) items of the check list.

The Curriculum Foundation Series showed inaccuracies in nine (9) items of the check list.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Evans, Margaret B. "Design in Children's Books". The Horn Book Magazine, Vol. XXVII, No. 3, 169-75; May-June, 1951.

Stutz, Fred. Eighteenth Yearbook, National Council for Social Studies 10; 88-93; 1947.

Williams, Paul T. "Textbooks Need Better Pictures". The Nation's Schools 33:50-52; June, 1944.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Evans, Margaret E. "Design in Children's Books". The Horn Book Magazine, Vol. XXVII, No. 3, 189-75; May-June, 1951.

Stutz, Fred. Eighteenth Yearbook, National Council for Social Studies 10; 88-93; 1947.

Williams, Paul T. "Textbooks Need Better Pictures". The Nation's Schools 38:50-52; June, 1944.

WHITE, MARGUERITE L.

AN ANALYSIS OF THE RELEVANCE OF ILLUSTRATIONS TO TEXT IN FIVE BASAL READING SERIES FOR GRADE III

BOSTON UNIVERSITY

1 1719 02558 7918

PRONG FASTENER BINDER

USE Fibre PRONG FASTENER

TO DUPLICATE REFER TO NUMBER

449-13

MADE IN U.S.A.